

Historic and Archaeological Resources

This chapter presents an overview of the existing identified historic and archaeological resources on and in the vicinity of Boston College's three campuses: Brighton, Chestnut Hill and Newton. This chapter also includes a description of the impacts of the projects proposed by Boston College over the next ten years on the identified historic and archaeological resources.

The first section of this chapter outlines the methodology used to identify inventoried and designated properties within one-quarter mile of the University's three campuses. For each campus, an overview is presented of the historic and archaeological resources that have been inventoried and officially designated, followed by a more specific description of the resources that are expected to be affected by the proposed projects. Also included for each campus is a summary of the proposed projects and an assessment of their expected impacts to affected inventoried and designated resources.

Methodology

VHB conducted the archaeological and architectural site files and records review to determine if any designated or inventoried historic and archaeological resources are located on or adjacent to the three Boston College campuses. This research was carried out at the Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC), which holds all of the documentation on historic properties, including archaeological reports, National Register nominations, and inventory forms. Information about historic properties was also obtained from the Boston Landmarks Commission (BLC) and the Newton Historical Commission.

The literature review completed at the Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC) identified properties listed in the Inventory of Historic and Archaeological Assets of the Commonwealth (inventoried properties) and the State Register of Historic Places (designated, or listed, properties). The site file search also identified previous cultural resource investigations, especially the archaeological investigations on both the Chestnut Hill and Newton campuses.

The Inventory of Historic and Archaeological Assets of the Commonwealth includes all buildings, structures, sites, and objects that have been recorded on inventory forms in the Commonwealth, not all of which have received an official designation or have been officially evaluated for their significance. The State Register of Historic Places was established in 1982 as a comprehensive listing of buildings, objects, structures, and sites that have received local, state or national designations based on their historical, architectural, or archaeological significance. All properties listed in the National Register of Historic Places are automatically entered in to the State Register of Historic Places.

Brighton Campus

The Boston College Brighton Campus contains and is adjacent to a number of previously recorded historic districts, areas, and individual properties as shown in Figure 8-1 and listed below:

- Chancery-St. John's Seminary Complex (BOS.JW) - as noted below in more detail, the Seminary Complex was determined by the MHC (December 2003) to be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places as a "potential historic district" that contains a number of contributing elements. The majority of the Brighton campus overlaps with the Chancery-St. John's Seminary Complex.
- Foster Street Area (BOS.LA) - no determination has been made regarding the National Register eligibility for the Foster Street Area and the Area Form does not indicate the number of properties that are considered contributing elements to the area. The eastern section of the Brighton Campus contains three residences on Foster Street, all of which are part of the Foster Street Area.
- Lake Street-Chandler's Pond Area (BOS.JV) - the Lake Street-Chandler's Pond Area was determined by the MHC (March 1996) to be eligible for the National Register; the area includes 17 properties that are considered contributing elements to the area.
- Pama Gardens (BOS.JZ) - this area consists of nine residential apartment buildings; no determination has been made regarding the National Register eligibility for the Pama Gardens Area.
- Upper Foster Street Area (BOS.JY) - no determination has been made regarding the National Register eligibility for the Upper Foster Street Area; the Area Form indicates that there are 17 properties that are considered contributing elements to the area.
- Upper Chestnut Hill-Evergreen Area (BOS.JX) - the Upper Chestnut Hill-Evergreen Area was determined by the MHC (November 2006) to be eligible for

listing in the National Register; the Area Form indicates that there are 26 properties that are considered contributing elements to the area. In addition, a portion of this area contains the Aberdeen Architectural Conservation District.

- There are several individually inventoried properties located within one-quarter mile of the Brighton Campus.



Chancery - St. John's Complex

Boston College has acquired approximately 65 acres of land from the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Boston (RCAB) that included St John's Seminary, Chancery Offices and the Cardinal's Residence. The Chancery-St. John's Seminary Complex was identified and evaluated in 2004 in MHC's *Survey of Historic Properties of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese in the City of Boston – Summary Report (Archdiocese Summary Report)* and was subsequently recorded on an Area Form in MHC's Inventory as a "potential historic district" (MHC #BOS.JW). The Chancery-St. John's Seminary Complex consists of older buildings, structures, and landscapes located north of Commonwealth Avenue generally between Lake Street and Foster Street in Brighton. Buildings and structures located within the Seminary Complex that are considered by the MHC as contributing elements to the Seminary Complex include:

- Theology House (MHC #BOS.8242)
- St. John's Seminary Chapel (MHC #BOS.8243)
- Peterson Hall (MHC #BOS.8529)
- Kitchen and Refectory (MHC #BOS.15237)
- St. William's Hall (MHC #BOS.8530)
- Keith Memorial Gymnasium (MHC #BOS.8531)
- Clergy Personnel Building (Tribunal Building) (MHC #BOS.8532)
- Archbishop's House (Cardinal's Residence) (MHC #BOS.8533)
- St. Clement's Hall (MHC #BOS.8534)
- Main Entrance Gate (MHC #BOS.9316)
- Shrine of the Immaculate Conception (MHC #BOS.9317)
- Service Building (Garage) (MHC #BOS.15234)
- Boston Roman Catholic Church Chancery (MHC #BOS.15235))
- Creagh Research Library (MHC #BOS.15236)
- Library (Seminary Library) (MHC #BOS.15238)

The Seminary Complex history at the Brighton Campus began in 1881 with the construction of the Theology House. Prior to the RCAB occupation, the site was occupied by a number of farmsteads or country estates. Review of historic period maps (1875-1925) indicates that a number of wood frame structures and outbuildings were located on what is now the Brighton Campus in 1875 along Lake Street, Foster Street, and South Street (now Commonwealth Avenue).

Boston College acquired 43 acres (of the total 65 acres) of the Seminary Complex in 2004 and filed an amendment to the previous Boston College IMP with the Boston Redevelopment Authority (BRA) in July 2006. The amendment included Boston College's plans for St. William's Hall, the Cardinal's Residence, the Tribunal Building, and the Gymnasium, including planned renovations to each building except the Gymnasium. The MHC commented on the proposed amendment on August 4, 2006 indicating that the three buildings proposed for renovation (St. William's Hall, the Cardinal's Residence, and the Tribunal Building) are historically and architecturally significant and appear to meet the Criteria of Eligibility (36 CFR Part 60) for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

The Brighton Campus has not been subject to any archaeological investigations. Additionally, the Brighton Campus does not contain any previously recorded archaeological sites.



Foster Street Area

The Foster Street Area consists of a number of residential structures along the northern section of Foster Street and is situated immediately east of the Boston College Brighton Campus. No recommendation or determination has been made regarding the National Register eligibility of the Foster Street Area.

Boston College proposes to demolish three residences located at 188, 192, and 196 Foster Street and replace them with 50,000 sf of Jesuit faculty and graduate student housing for the Weston Jesuit School of Theology. All three structures are in the Foster Street Area (MHC #BOS.LA)¹ and are individually recorded in MHC's Inventory. Both 188 and 192 Foster Street were formerly owned by the RCAB and served as housing for its administrative employees. Neither property is included in the Chancery-St. John's Seminary Complex Area Form (MHC #BOS.JW), nor are they contributing elements to the Seminary Complex. The building at 196 Foster Street was not owned by the RCAB. The *Archdiocese Summary Report* indicates that both 188 and 192 Foster Street have not yet been evaluated by the MHC to determine if they meet the Criteria of Eligibility (36 CFR Part 60) for listing in the National Register. There has been no evaluation for 196 Foster Street.

Review of historic maps of the Foster Street Area (1875-1925) indicates that all three structures were constructed between 1875 and 1885. The structure at 188 Foster Street (MHC #BOS.15217) is a modest example of Victorian eclectic architecture but the front porch appears to be a later addition. The building at 192 Foster Street (MHC #BOS.8149) retains no historic integrity. The building at 196 Foster St (MHC



¹The property referenced as 196 Foster Street is recorded in the MHC inventory (MHC #BOS.8150) as being located at 194 Foster Street. The property is actually located at 196 Foster Street and it is referenced throughout the Boston College IMPNF as being located at that same address. For purposes of consistency during the discussion of this property in this chapter, the property will continue to be referenced as 196 Foster Street.

#BOS.8150) is a simple gable front Italianate house which has been altered through the infilling of two second story windows on the façade, leaving only a single window at that story.



IMP Projects

This section describes the proposed projects on the Brighton Campus and their potential effect on the identified inventoried and designated resources on or near the campus. Only the potential impacts to inventoried and designated resources are described in this discussion. The section is divided into new construction projects, renovations, and demolitions.

New Construction

Planned construction on the Brighton Campus includes the following (see Chapter 3, Ten-Year Plan for Boston Properties):

- ▶ A 75-bed graduate student and faculty housing complex for the Weston Jesuit School of Theology. The construction of the new graduate housing complex will involve the demolition of the three structures at 188, 192, and 196 Foster Street, which are included in the Foster Street Area (MHC #BOS.LA) as described earlier.
- ▶ The Brighton Athletics Center which includes intercollegiate baseball and softball facilities, two intramural playing fields, a field house with an indoor track, six indoor tennis courts, and supporting facilities. The existing site consists of playing fields and no structures will be impacted by the development of the complex.
- ▶ A new 500-space parking garage on a currently undeveloped site just south of Brighton Athletics Center project.
- ▶ A 14,000 sf. Library Storage building just north of the existing Seminary Library. Construction of Library Storage building may have a visual impact on the Seminary Library.
- ▶ One undergraduate residence hall containing 200 beds on the corner of Commonwealth Avenue and the Brighton Campus spine road.
- ▶ Three hundred beds of undergraduate housing in the center of the campus on an existing parking lot northeast of St. William's Hall. These residence halls could have a visual impact on St. William's Hall, the Gymnasium, and the Library.

- ▶ A Fine Arts District, consisting of a 1,200 seat auditorium, the Boston College McMullen Museum of Art, and a Fine Arts/Academic building would be located on Commonwealth Avenue between the former Cardinal's residence and the former Creagh Library.

No archaeological investigations have been conducted on the Brighton Campus. To date no archaeological resources have been identified that would be impacted by the proposed institutional projects.

Renovation of Existing Buildings

Boston College plans to renovate five buildings on the Brighton Campus. One of those buildings is St. William's Hall, which was added to the existing Boston College IMP in an IMP Amendment approved in 2006. Renovations are also planned for the STM Library (former Seminary Library), Bishop Peterson Hall, the Chancery, and the Creagh Library. The proposed renovation of the STM Library is addressed in an IMPNF for an IMP Amendment and a PNF submitted by Boston College to the BRA on October 12, 2007. The renovation of Bishop Peterson Hall, the Chancery and the Creagh Library are addressed in this IMPNF in Chapter 3, *Ten-Year Plan - Boston*.

MHC commented on the renovation of St. William's Hall and requested the opportunity to review the proposed renovation plans in order to identify architecturally significant interior features that should be preserved prior to the implementation of the proposed renovation projects. Boston College will file all required Project Notification Forms to MHC on the proposed renovation of the STM Library, Bishop Peterson Hall, the Chancery, the Creagh Library and St. Williams Hall.

Demolition

The only demolitions on the Brighton Campus currently anticipated in the next ten years are the St. John's Seminary Service Building (MHC #BOS.15234), which is a contributing element of the Chancery-St. John's Seminary Complex, and the demolition of the three residential structures at 188, 192, and 196 Foster Street, which are included in the Foster Street Area (MHC #BOS.LA).

Service Building

Boston College plans to demolish the service building and create landscaped open space to replace open areas lost for new construction and to create a buffer between the planned garage and adjacent residential properties. The service building was constructed in the 1960s and serves as a garage and maintenance building. It was identified as a contributing element of the Chancery-St. John's Seminary Complex in the 2003-2004 survey. According to the Area Form, the service building has a low

profile that blends in with the Chancery-St. John's Seminary Complex landscape and does not detract from the prominence of the other buildings on campus.

Foster Street Residences

The three residences at 188, 192, and 196 Foster Street are proposed to be removed and replaced by a 75-bed student residence to be used by Jesuit faculty and graduate students in Weston Jesuit School of Theology. As noted above, all three structures have been individually inventoried by the MHC and are contributing elements to the Foster Street Area. Demolition of the three structures is subject to the Boston Landmarks Commission (BLC) demolition delay ordinance. Their demolition may be delayed up to 90 days following BLC comment on their demolition if the BLC requests preservation of the properties or mitigation of demolition.

Chestnut Hill Campus



Cultural Resources

Similar to the Brighton Campus, the Chestnut Hill Campus contains individual properties as shown on Figure 8-1 and is adjacent to a number of previously recorded historic districts and areas. The Chestnut Hill Campus is recorded on an Area Form (MHC #NWT.DI) and contains five inventoried structures on the Middle Campus:

- Gasson Hall (NWT.5397)
- St. Mary's Hall (NWT.5398)
- Bapst/Burns Library (NWT.5399)
- Devlin Hall (NWT.5400)
- Fulton Hall (NWT.5401)

Review of MHC's inventory indicates that the following inventoried areas and historic districts are located immediately adjacent to the Chestnut Hill campus:

- Chestnut Hill Reservoir and Pumping Stations Complex (BOS.LX), which also includes the Cochituate and Sudbury Aqueduct Linear Districts (BOS.LY and BOS.SK). Both the Chestnut Hill Reservoir and the Pumping Stations (BOS.LW) are listed in the National Register of Historic Places as contributing elements to the Chestnut Hill Reservoir Historic District (CHRHD) (BOS.LX). The CHRHD is a Local Historic District (September 26, 1989), a National Register District (January 18, 1990), and is also included in the National Register Thematic Resource Area of the Metropolitan District Water Commission (September 18, 1990) (BOS.LV).

- Chestnut Hill Historic District (NWT.O, NWT.AJ, and NWT.EG) is listed in the National Register of Historic Places (September 4, 1986 and February 16, 1990) and is a local historic district regulated by the Chestnut Hill Historic District Commission. The Chestnut Hill Historic District contains approximately 168 properties and is located immediately south of the Boston College Chestnut Hill Campus. The Chestnut Hill Historic District also contains a number of buildings that are currently owned by the University, including the entire Hammond Triangle area.
- Upper Chestnut Hill -- Evergreen Area (BOS.JX) consists of 26 contributing elements to the historic district including a number of residential structures and the Evergreen Cemetery. The Upper Chestnut Hill -- Evergreen Area is contiguous to the northeastern portion of the Boston College Chestnut Hill campus as well as the southern portion of the Boston College Brighton Campus.
- Commonwealth Avenue Historic District (NWT.AB) is listed in the National Register of Historic Places as an historic district (February 16, 1990) and is included in the Newton NR MRA – 1908-1940 (February 16, 1990). The Commonwealth Avenue Historic District contains 321 properties and is located immediately north and west of the Boston College Chestnut Hill Campus and does not include any resources associated with the MBTA system.
- Monadnock Road Historic District (NWT.AE) is listed in the National Register of Historic Places as an historic district (February 16, 1990) and is included in the Newton NR MRA – 1908-1940 (February 16, 1990). It contains 89 properties and is located immediately west of the Boston College Chestnut Hill Campus.
- Quincy Road – Mayflower – Priscilla Road – Old Colony Road Area (NWT.BA) is an inventoried area immediately west of the Boston College Chestnut Hill Campus and includes a number of properties that are currently owned by the University. The Area Form does not indicate how many properties are included in the Area.
- There are also a number of individually inventoried properties (not located in areas or historic districts) that are located immediately north and west of the Chestnut Hill Campus.

Unlike the Brighton Campus, the Chestnut Hill Campus was subject to a reconnaissance archaeological and architectural survey in 1994 in conjunction with the previous Boston College IMP. The survey identified areas that were considered to be archaeologically sensitive and, as a result, the MHC requested that they be subject to additional archaeological survey. The western portion of the Middle Campus and the southern portion of the Upper Campus were determined to be moderately sensitive to contain archaeological resources, while the Hammond Triangle section of the Chestnut Hill Campus was determined to be highly sensitive to contain archaeological resources. Subsequent archaeological investigations identified archaeological sites in those locations, but none of the sites were determined eligible for listing in the National Register.

New Construction

Boston Portion of the Chestnut Hill Campus

Planned construction on the Boston portion of the Chestnut Hill Campus includes the following:

- An undergraduate residence hall (420 beds), first floor retail (12,000 sf), and underground parking (up to 100 spaces) on the existing site of More Hall which will be demolished. The demolition and construction associated with this IMP project has the potential to impact the Evergreen Cemetery which is located immediately adjacent to the project.
- A Recreation Center on the current site of Edmonds Hall which will be demolished. The demolition of Edmonds Hall and construction of the Recreation Center will not have any impact on significant cultural resources.
- Undergraduate residence halls (490 beds) on part of Commander Shea Field. The construction of this series of buildings involves the elimination of the existing baseball field which will be relocated to the Brighton Campus. The site is adjacent to the Chestnut Hill Reservoir, which is listed in the National Register of Historic Places and is a local Boston Landmark. Although this project will be located adjacent to the Chestnut Hill Reservoir and Pumping Station Complex, it does not appear that it will have any impact on significant cultural resources.
- A 350-space addition to the Beacon Street Garage. It does not appear that the construction of this project will have any impact on significant cultural resources.
- Undergraduate residence halls (175 beds) with student life or academic uses on part of the site of the current Modular Housing. The construction of this series of buildings will involve the demolition of a number of Modular Apartments. It does not appear this project will have any impact on significant cultural resources.
- University Center on an existing parking area and a portion of the Flynn Recreation Complex site. The construction of the University Center will involve the demolition of the Flynn Student Recreation Complex which will be replaced by a new Recreation Center on the site of Edmonds Hall. It does not appear that the construction of the new University Center will have any impact on significant cultural resources.

Newton Portion of the Chestnut Hill Campus

Planned construction on the Newton portion of the Chestnut Hill Campus includes the following:

- The Science Center on the site of Cushing Hall and a portion of a service building. The proposed Science Center is located immediately southeast of Fulton Hall, which was determined to be eligible for listing in the National Register by the MHC. The new Science Center could have a visual impact on Fulton Hall.
- The construction of the 85,000 sf Stokes Commons involves the alteration of and addition to Lyons Hall. This area is in a portion of the Chestnut Hill campus that was indicated as archaeologically sensitive. Portions of this area were previously tested during a subsequent intensive survey and no archaeological sites were identified that were eligible for the National Register.
- Construction of an Academic Building for Nursing and Social Work (75,000 sf.) involves the demolition of the McElroy Switch House. It does not appear that the construction of this project will have any impact on significant cultural resources. This area is in a portion of the Chestnut Hill Campus that was indicated as archaeologically sensitive. Portions of this area were previously tested during a subsequent intensive survey and no archaeological sites were identified that were eligible for the National Register.
- Construction of an Academic Building for Humanities with possible underground parking up to 90 spaces (125,000 sf) with possible underground parking with up to 100 spaces involves the demolition of McElroy Commons. It does not appear that the construction of this IMP project will have any impact on significant cultural resources.



Renovation of Existing Buildings

The Boston College IMP proposes renovation of one building (Carney Hall) on the Chestnut Hill Campus. The building is located on the Middle Campus in the vicinity of a number of significant existing architectural resources. According to the 1994 report submitted by Timelines, Inc., a number of buildings on the Boston College Middle Campus meet the Criteria of Eligibility (36 CFR Part 60) for listing in the National Register.



Demolition

Several buildings on the Chestnut Hill Campus will be demolished to make room for the projects proposed in the IMP. The following sections describe those buildings and the likely impact of their demolition on cultural resources.

More Hall and Relocation of St. Thomas More Road

More Hall and St. Thomas More Road are currently situated at the northeast corner of the Boston College Chestnut Hill Campus. Both More Hall and St. Thomas More Road are contiguous to the Evergreen Cemetery and the Upper Chestnut Hill-Evergreen area. Both the Evergreen Cemetery and the Upper Chestnut Hill-Evergreen area meet the Criteria of Eligibility (36 CFR Part 60) (opinions by BLC and MHC) for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (Evergreen Cemetery individually and Upper Chestnut Hill-Evergreen Area as a district).

St. Thomas More Road is owned and managed by the Department of Conservation and Recreation (DCR) as part of the Chestnut Hill Reservation, which occupies about 120 acres in Brighton, abutting Newton and Brookline. While the entire length of St. Thomas More Road is included as part of DCR's Chestnut Hill Reservation, no section of St. Thomas More Road is part of the Chestnut Hill Reservoir and Pumping Stations Complex (which is listed in the State and National Registers of Historic Places and is a Designated Boston Landmark). The Chestnut Hill Reservoir and Pumping Stations Complex is located immediately south and east of St. Thomas More Road and its boundaries differ slightly from DCR's Chestnut Hill Reservation.

The demolition of More Hall and the re-alignment of St. Thomas More Road may have an effect on the Evergreen Cemetery, which, as noted above, is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Evergreen Cemetery was established in 1848 and appears to have been used continuously through the present day. The route of St. Thomas More Road is proposed to be re-aligned to connect with Commonwealth Avenue so that it is contiguous to the western edge of the Evergreen Cemetery.

Other Buildings on the Chestnut Hill Campus

The demolition of the following structures does not appear to have any impacts on significant cultural resources:

- Edmonds Hall
- The Modular Apartments
- Flynn Student Recreation Complex
- Cushing Hall

- Service Building
- McElroy Commons. This area is in a portion of the Chestnut Hill Campus that was indicated in 1994 as archaeologically sensitive. Portions of this area were tested during a subsequent intensive survey and no archaeological sites were identified that were eligible for the National Register.
- McElroy Switch House. This area is in a portion of the Chestnut Hill campus that was indicated in 1994 as archaeologically sensitive. Portions of this area were tested during a subsequent intensive survey and no archaeological sites were identified that were eligible for the National Register.

Newton Campus



Cultural Resources

Similar to the Chestnut Hill and Brighton campuses, the Newton Campus contains, and is adjacent to, a number of previously recorded historic districts, areas, and individual properties (Figure 8-2). The Newton Campus is recorded on an Area Form (NWT.DL) and includes three inventoried structures.

- Harriman, Henry I. House (Alumni House) (NWT.5610)
- Schraft, George F. House (Barat House) (NWT.5396)
- Stuart, Janet Erskine House (NWT.5256)

A fourth inventoried structure is also located on the Newton campus, but was not included on the Newton Campus Area Form:

- Mill Street Cottage, 29 Mill Street (NWT.3148)

Review of MHC's inventory indicates that the following inventoried areas and historic districts are located immediately adjacent to the Newton Campus:

- Towle, Loren Estate - Newton Country Day School (NWT.5611)
- Towle Estate Area (NWT.BK)
- East Parish Burying Ground (NWT.801)
- Edmunds - Madden Estate (NWT.2826)

In addition there are several individually inventoried properties that are located within one-quarter mile of the Newton campus.

Demolition

Two structures are proposed for demolition on the Newton Campus: the Quonset hut which is in the northwestern portion of the campus and the Smith Wing of Stuart Hall. The Quonset hut is proposed to be replaced by a new Recreation/Athletics Building. The Smith Wing of Stuart Hall will be replaced with a new wing that will be constructed on the opposite side of Stuart Hall. This will open the existing quadrangle on the south side and enclose it on the north.

New Construction

There are three new construction projects on the Newton Campus:

- The proposed 150-space surface parking lot is located in the vicinity of a previously recorded archaeological site that was identified during an intensive archaeological survey of the campus and reported in a 1995 archaeological report. The new construction may have an effect on previously recorded archaeological sites.
- The construction of an 8,500 sf. recreation/athletics building involves the demolition of the Quonset Hut as described above. The proposed building is also in the vicinity of several recorded archaeological sites that were identified during an intensive archaeological survey of the campus. The new construction may have an effect on previously recorded archaeological sites.
- The construction of the 42,000 sq. ft. Smith Wing replacement involves an addition to and alteration of both the Stuart House and the Kenny-Cottle Library. This construction has the potential to impact the Stuart House. Also, this project is located immediately south of the Barat House, which was determined eligible for listing in the National Register by the MHC.

The Newton Campus was subject to a reconnaissance archaeological and architectural survey in 1994 in conjunction with the previous Boston College IMP. The survey identified areas that were considered to be archaeologically sensitive, and were therefore requested by the MHC to be subject to additional archaeological survey. Subsequent archaeological investigations identified archaeological sites on the campus; some of the sites were determined to not be eligible for listing in the National Register while three others have not yet been evaluated to determine if they are eligible for the National Register.